Overharvesting of Seafood: Did the Indians Affect their Environment?

by Michael Savarese
(Florida Gulf Coast University)

The Calusa were fisher-hunter-gatherers who relied upon the bounty of estuaries to provide adequate food for a large population and to develop a culturally and politically complex society. They collected a variety of shellfish species for food, but the American oyster (*Crassostrea virginica*), perhaps because of its widespread availability and abundance, was a staple food for many centuries, up to A.D. 1550. Many Calusa archaeological sites contain numerous oyster shells along with other mollusk shells and many fish bones. Archaeologists Karen Walker, Bill Marquardt, Victor Thompson, and I, a marine geologist, wondered whether the Calusa overharvested the oysters. Overharvesting could cause a shift to smaller sizes among individuals or, if severe enough, a permanent genetic change influencing future oyster growth or reproduction.

To investigate these questions, we sampled oyster-rich layers from middens from (1) the Late Archaic (around 2000-500 B.C.) of Useppa and Calusa Islands (in Pine Island Sound), and (2) the more recent (500 B.C.-A.D. 1500) Caloosahatchee I, II, and IV cultural periods of Mound Key (Estero Bay) and Pineland (Pine Island Sound). Radiocarbon dating was used to assign each sample to a cultural period. We used taphonomic grading, a method commonly employed in paleontology, to establish whether oysters were collected alive as food, or dead for building material. Taphonomic grading is an assessment of the quality of shell preservation. Bivalve mollusks, such as oysters, if collected alive, have pristine shell interiors. If collected dead from reefs, the oyster shells would have interiors encrusted or corroded by other organisms, such as boring sponges, oyster drills, and barnacles.

Samples from all shell midden layers showed relatively clean shell interiors. Dead oyster shells collected from oyster reefs in Estero Bay and Pine Island Sound for comparison had significantly more evidence of encrustation and corrosion. This confirms that throughout their history the Indian people collected oysters for food before using the shells as mound-building material.

But did the Calusa affect the oyster populations? When we measured the sizes of oysters and compared them across cultural periods and localities, oyster shells from times of peak Calusa population during the later Caloosahatchee periods were significantly smaller compared to the those from the earlier periods, and shells from both samples were smaller than those of modern oyster populations that live in protected areas that are not harvested at all. This shift to a smaller mean size and subsequent return to pre-Calusa size suggests that Native Americans did overharvest enough to cause a population shift, but they did not permanently influence the oysters’ potential for growth. This pattern is not affected by climatic conditions; the size shift persists through a number of climatic warm and cool intervals.

Results from this study suggest that oysters always existed in abundance, though not to such an extent as to avoid all effects of overharvesting. Today, however, the American oyster is often commercially harvested from our Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico estuaries so intensively that oyster reef density and areal extent have been severely reduced. When coupled with other human-induced causes of estuarine health decline, such as habitat destruction, disease, and nutrient enrichment, historically productive oyster beds in places like Chesapeake...
Bay, New York Harbor, and Apalachicola, Florida are mere remnants of their former selves. Southwest Florida’s oyster reefs, though not commercially harvested, have declined for other reasons, and this has contributed significantly to the degradation of our coastal waters.

Overharvesting of shellfish and finfish beyond a species’ ability to sustain a healthy population size is a common societal problem that must be resolved. Overharvesting, however, is not an exclusively modern occurrence. Our work shows that Indian peoples were also capable of influencing native species through overfishing and over-hunting.

Summer 2014 excavations at Mound Key, which contains many oyster shells.

The Randell Research Center (Cindy Bear, coordinator) greatly facilitated this research, allowing use of the RRC’s Ruby Gill House as a field headquarters. RRC volunteers Jim Friedlander, Alan Marcus, and Frank Potter kindly provided boat transportation. Field and laboratory assistance was provided by numerous FGCU students, but most significantly by Shanna Stingu, John Milcetic, Sara Hilderbrandt, Candise Forde, Jacqueline Fitzgerald, Wade Kemp, Kerri Foote, Emma Fain, Alex Maruszczak, and Jeff Rice.

New and Renewing Friends of the RRC
November 16, 2015 to February 15, 2016

Please let us know of any errors or omissions. Thank you for your support.

**Benefactors** ($20,000-$99,999)
Maple Hill Foundation

**Sustaining Members** ($5,000-$19,999)
Randy Wayne White*

**Supporting Members** ($1,000-$4,999)
Anonymous
Laurence & Carol Aten
John & Gretchen Coyle
Marty Harney*
Kayak Voyagers*
Don & Dawn Marano
Mark Marinello*
Victor Mayeron*
Deborah Russell & Elmer Wheeler
Robert A. Wells, Jr.
Useppa Inn and Dock Company*

**Contributing Members** ($100-$499)
Marion Almy
Virginia Amsler
Brad Anderson
Sherrill Binford Sims
Lyndon Borrero
Joseph P. Brinton
Jeff Brown & Ann Baillargeon
Bobbi & Jim Caraway
Jeff Cavanagh
Brian & Denise Cobb
Howard & Nancy DeVane
Arlene Drack & Bill Emerson
Guy P. Fischer
Florida Museum of Natural History*
Gary S. Foster
Mark & Kathy Futch
Douglas & Sherry Gentry
Chauncey & Allison Goss
Porter & Mariel Goss
Jennifer Haney
Barbara & Carl Harcourt
Douglas Jones
Marge & Coty Keller
August Landl
Karen Malesky
Trey Malloy
Alan & Ruth Marcus
William Marquardt
Laurencine Mazzoli
Karen McCrea
Brian Mengle
John & Sue Miller
Paul & Warren Miller
Richard & Annette O’Brien
Charles O’Connor*
Dave Paulin
Howie & Janey Pentony
Bill & Norma Pretsch
Debbie Randell
Beverly Sensbach
Gayle & Jim Sheets
John & Linda Sirmans
Michael & Cathleen Smith
Peter Sottong*
Maddie & Sam Stewart
Anna L. Stober
Beverly & Roger Stone
Paula & John Streeter
Sweetwater Branch Inn*
Vince Tapager
Tarpon Lodge*
Gary & Donna Terwilliger
Jon & Beverly Thompson
Judith & Earle Timothy
John Touchett
Karen Walker
Nick & Kay West
Jim & Anne Whitmore

**Family Members**
Gloria & Andy Andrews
Leigh & Genie Andrews
Robert Bendt
Fred Broune
Carolyn & Tom Crosby
John & Donna divito
Jack & Rosealie Hewins
Brian Just
Frederick Mann
Robert Mast
Dana & Wendy Morgan
Nancy Starner
Gregory Wampole
Norris & Nancy Williams
Ed Winn
Gary & Lucie Zuchowski

**Individual Members**
Peter Corcoran
Judith D’Agostino
Phyllis Faust
Margaret Guccione
Randall Johnson
David Karrer
Keith Keefer
Judy Marshall
Bill Schneider
Carole Z. Scott
Geraldine Westlund
Molly Butler Whitney
Catherine E. Williams
Lloyd B. Wilson

* = donated goods and services.
Randy Wayne White Hosts Fundraiser for RRC

February 11 “Calusa Coast” Event at Doc Ford’s Brings in Needed Funds

by Bill Marquardt

More than 50 people showed up at Doc Ford’s Rum Bar & Grille in Captiva recently for an afternoon of food, cocktails, stories, and a fantastic auction of unusual items, all contributed for the benefit of the Randell Research Center endowment fund. New York Times-bestselling author Randy Wayne White hosted the event, welcoming the attendees and speaking about the importance of preserving and learning from archaeological sites such as Pineland. Fans of Randy’s flew in from as far away as California, Iowa, and Michigan. RRC staffers Cindy Bear and Linda Heffner were there, along with a number of RRC members. Making the trip from Gainesville were Florida Museum director Doug Jones, associate director Beverly Sensbach, development director Marie Emmerson, annual giving and development coordinator Kara Schwartz, development assistant Brittany Snipes, and archaeologists Karen Walker and Bill Marquardt.

Food and service were donated by Randy and his business partners, Marty Harrity and Mark Marinello. Doc’s-Captiva manager Julie Grzeszak and her staff did a fine job helping set up for the event and made sure everyone got food and drinks. Victor Mayeron donated his services as auctioneer. Randy’s donations to the auction included a guided trip to Cuba, a baseball signed by President Jimmy Carter, a signed manuscript of a Doc Ford novel, rare Cuban cigars, naming of a character in his next novel, a half-day flight in his seaplane piloted by Mark Futch, two signed framed photographs, and two week-long stays in his Pineland home.

Red Sox Hall-of-Famer Bill “Spaceman” Lee contributed a signed photo and bat. Kayak Voyagers donated a 5-day cruise for two to the Berry Islands in The Bahamas. Tarpon Lodge contributed a stay at the Lodge, and Useppa Island donated a stay in the Collier Inn and a one-year preferred membership in the Useppa Island Club. A Florida Gator football weekend with game tickets for two and lodging at Sweetwater Branch Inn was donated by the Florida Museum and Sweetwater Branch Inn, and Peter Sottong donated plated silver replicas of the pelican and deer head wooden artifacts from the Key Marco site.

Charles O’Connor donated a complete giant fossil shark tooth and a half-day fossiling trip for four to the Peace River, while Bill Marquardt offered a tour of Pineland and Useppa Island, with lunch for two on Useppa. Proceeds from the auction will be put toward research, site interpretation, and education. We express our sincere appreciation for the outpouring of support by Randy and many others who contributed auction items and attended the event. Thank you all!

FHC Grant Awarded to Interpret the Smith and Low Mounds!

As we go to print, we’ve just received notice that the Florida Humanities Council has granted funds for new signs to teach about the Smith and Low Mounds on an extended Calusa Heritage Trail. The 5 acres containing these mounds were purchased last year with funds donated by the Sear Family Foundation and the Calusa Land Trust. The Smith Mound is a burial mound dating to A.D. 900 and the Low Mound is a midden mound dating to about A.D. 300. The grant funds will primarily cover the costs associated with developing new artwork by artist Merald Clark and the fabrication and installation of the signs. Merald is responsible for the dynamic and informational signage currently seen by visitors on the Calusa Heritage Trail. We anticipate opening the area in March of 2017 with a public event. However, we are still in the process of raising the required funds to extend the fences and clear the invasive exotic vegetation. To make a donation earmarked for this project, please contact Cindy Bear at clbear@ufl.edu or 239-283-6168.
Annual Honor Roll, 2015

Each year the Randell Research Center recognizes all those who have donated $100 or more during the previous calendar year by listing them in the Annual Honor Roll. We extend our heartfelt appreciation for the support that these and all our gifts represent (* = in-kind services).

BENEFactors
($20,000 – $99,999)
Robin & Jan Brown
Paul & Warren Miller

SuSTAINING MEMBERS
($5,000 – $19,999)
Chris & Gayle Bundschu
Tim & Judith Sean
Robert & Phyllis Wells

SuPportING MEMBERS
($1,000 – $4,999)
Virginia Amsler
Lawrence & Carol Aten
Coilair*
John & Gretchen Coyle
Don & Dawn Marano
Laurenceine Mazzoli
Virginia O’Neill
Nick & Linda Penniman
Bill & Norma Pretsch
Crandon Randell & Gayle Allegro
Debbie Randell
Deborah Russell & Elmer Wheeler
Maddie & Sam Stewart
Patricio & Alan Symonds

SPONSORING MEMBERS
($500 – $999)
Paul Benedum, Jr.
Lammot duPont

Cathy House
& Bob House
Sandy House
Stanley & Dee Ink
Denege Patterson
Anne Reynolds
Bob & Mary Rude
Carl & Kathryn Schroeder
Gayle & Jim Sheets
Pat Yourdon

CONTRIBUTING MEMBERS
($100 – $499)
Marion Almy
Brenda Anderson
Paul & Eileen Arsenault
Valerie Ballou
Tony & Lisa Banguilan
Peter & Gudrun Bennett
Riley & Peggy Bitch
Nancy Brous
Bob & Liz Buxkly
John & Marla Carr
Patricia Casanova
Jefferson Chapman
Ann & S. Cordell
Robert D. Crum
Carole L. Crumley
Don Cyzewski
Bill & Mary Cyzewski
Shelley & Russell Davis
Cyndi Dergon
& Jeff Nuggett
Howard & Nancy Devane
Phyllis Douc
Dawn-Marie Driscoll

Charles & Sass Edwards
Guy P. Fischer
Tucki & Chip Folkers
Gary Foster
Robin & Lin Fox
Sue Gaire
Kim E. Gibbons
Nancy Glickman & Robert Macomber
Mimi Hollway
E. L. Roy Hunt
Dennis & Susan Isenhagen
Peter & Colette Johnson
Marge & Coty Keller
John & Martha Kendall
Ronald & Mary Koontz
Laura Kozuch
Robin C. Kriwane
Janet Levy
Robert & Judith Livingston
Darci MacMahon
Mary Blue Maugruder

Diane Maher
Manatee/Sarasota
Sierra Club
Alan & Ruth Marcus
Laurence & Maureen
Massey
Janet & Lamar
Matthews
Ted & Diane McGee
Robert N. McQueen
Jerald T. Milanich
John & Sue Miller
Jacob L. Miller
Carolyn M. Murphey
Betsy J. Jim Murphy
Margi Nanney
Abraham & Cynthia Ofer
Frank & Linda Potter
William & Mary
Reasner
Robert Repenning &
Jennet Buri
M.J. & Bill Roache
Kim & Kris Sears

Larry Slick
Doug Stafford
Beverly & Roger Stone
Vince Tapager
Turrell, Hall & Associates
Don & Kay Van Riper
Bill Vernetson
Sherry Waines
Randal L. Walker
Dave & Vicky Werner
Patty & Jack Wettstein
Jim & Anne Whitmore
Mr. & Mrs. William Winterer
WMS/LLS
Archaeological Society
Sally Woliver
Ann Wollschlagler
Craig & Bonnie Woodward
Lee & Betty Zausner

RRC News

Editor: William Marquardt
Writers:
Bill Marquardt
Michael Savarese
All figures by M. Savarese unless otherwise noted.
Production: GBS Productions

Gift Shop & Tour Information:
(239) 283-2157
Send questions or comments to:
Randell Research Center
PO Box 608
Pineland, FL 33945-0608
Telephone: (239) 283-2062
Email: rrc@flmnh.ufl.edu
Website: www.flmnh.ufl.edu/RRC/
Dear Friend,

You are cordially invited to join, or renew your membership in, the RRC’s support society, Friends of the Randell Research Center. All Friends of the RRC receive a quarterly newsletter and free admission to the Calusa Heritage Trail at Pineland. Supporters at higher levels are entitled to discounts on our books and merchandise, advance notice of programs, and special recognition. Your continuing support is vital to our mission. It means more research, more education, and continued site improvements at the Randell Research Center. Thank you.

Sincerely,

William H. Marquardt
Director
Randell Research Center

Please check the membership level you prefer, and send this form with your check payable to U. F. Foundation, to:

Membership Coordinator ● Randell Research Center ● PO Box 608 ● Pineland, Florida 33945

- Individual ($30) and Student ($15): quarterly Newsletter and free admission to Calusa Heritage Trail
- Family ($50): The above + advance notice on special events and programs
- Contributor ($100-$499): The above + annual honor roll listing in newsletter + 10% discount on RRC publications and merchandise
- Sponsor ($500-$999): The above + invitation to annual Director’s tour and reception
- Supporter ($1,000-$4,999): The above + listing on annual donor plaque at Pineland site
- Sustaining Members ($5,000-$19,999), Benefactors ($20,000-$99,999), and Patrons ($100,000 and above) receive all of the above + complimentary RRC publications and special briefings from the Director.

The Randell Research Center is a program of the Florida Museum of Natural History, University of Florida.
To place order, make check payable to
U.F. Foundation and mail to:
Randell Research Center
PO Box 608
Pineland, FL 33945.
Questions? 239-283-2157
E-mail: rrc@flmnh.ufl.edu

Name (please print): ________________________________________________
Mailing address (please print): ________________________________________
Zip code (please print): _____________________________________________

BOOKS ON SOUTHWEST FLORIDA'S ARCHAEOLOGY & HISTORY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BOOKS ORDERED</th>
<th>COST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Plant World of the Calusa: A View from Pineland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Calusa and Their Legacy: South Florida People and Their Environments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Archaeology of Pineland: A Coastal Southwest Florida Site Complex, A.D. 50-1710</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discovering Florida: First--Contact Narratives from Spanish Expeditions along the Lower Gulf Coast</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharks and Shark Products in Prehistoric South Florida</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Archaeology of Useppa Island</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Words, Old Songs: Understanding the Lives of Ancient Peoples in Southwest Florida Through Archaeology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fisherfolk of Charlotte Harbor, Florida</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edisonia Native Girl: The Life Story of Florence Keen Sansom</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida's First People</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missions to the Calusa</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida's Indians</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida's Indians.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archaeology of Pre-Columbian Florida</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Randy Wayne White's Ultimate Tarpon Book: The Birth of Big Game Fishing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Cross and the Mask</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Song of the Tides</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eyes of the Calusa</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Crafts of Florida's First People</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Images from the Calusa Heritage Trail</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RRC postcards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Award-Winning Documentaries</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Domain of the Calusa: Archaeology and Adventure in the Discovery of South Florida's Past</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expedition Florida: Three-Program Set (From Exploration to Exhibition, The Wild Heart of Florida, Wild Alachua)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RRC Research Center Gear</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RRC logo hat $21.95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RRC logo short-sleeve cotton staff shirt, blue</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specify size (S, M, L, XL) $36.95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RRC logo short-sleeve cotton T-shirt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specify size (S, M, L, XL) $18.95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calusa Heritage Trail T-shirts designed by Merald Clark:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specify size (S, M, L, XL)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Seven Masks (black with white image, seven Calusa masks), $18.95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Pineland Crane Head (white with full color depiction), $18.95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total for items ordered:
Friends of the RRC who give at the $100 level or above may deduct 10% Discount: —
Florida residents add sales tax: —
Shipping: Add $3.50 for first item, $1.00 for each additional item:
TOTAL: $